

**INVESTIGATION ON THE APPLICABILITY OF
BOTTOM ASH FOR RESTORATION OF CLAY MINES
IN SRI LANKA**

Sivaraman Suloshini

198034E

Degree of Master of Philosophy

Department of Civil Engineering

University of Moratuwa

Sri Lanka

November 2021

**INVESTIGATION ON THE APPLICABILITY OF
BOTTOM ASH FOR RESTORATION OF CLAY MINES
IN SRI LANKA**

Sivaraman Suloshini

198034E

Thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree Master of
Philosophy in Civil Engineering

Department of Civil Engineering

University of Moratuwa

Sri Lanka

November 2021

DECLARATION

I declare that this is my own work and this thesis does not incorporate without acknowledgement of any material previously submitted for a Degree or Diploma in any other University or institute of higher learning and to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person except where the acknowledgement is made in the text.

Also, I hereby grant to University of Moratuwa the non-exclusive right to reproduce and distribute my thesis, in whole or in part in print, electronic or other medium. I retain the right to use this content in whole or part in future works (such as articles or books).

Signature:

Date:

S. Suloshini

The above candidate has carried out research for the MPhil thesis/ dissertation under my supervision.

Signature of the supervisors:

Date:

.....

Dr.(Mrs). A.S. Ranathunga

.....

Prof. S.A.S. Kulathilaka

.....

Prof.(Ms). W.B. Gunawardana

ABSTRACT

Investigation on the Applicability of Bottom Ash for Restoration of Clay Mines in Sri Lanka

The higher cost associated with the restoration of clay mines and shortage of suitable filling materials have created many abandoned clay mines in Sri Lanka, leading to various environmental and health issues. Bottom ash (BA) generated during the coal combustion process as a by-product is one such potential fill material. Therefore, utilizing BA as a full or partial replacement of soil during clay mine restoration is the main objective of this study which was fulfilled under four sub-objectives: 1) potential as a backfill material, 2) ability to prevent soil erosion, 3) potential as a soil amendment material and 4) environmental impact.

BA was collected from the Lakvijaya power plant in Norochcholai, Sri Lanka. In addition, the suitability of BA as a full or partial replacement for soil was tested with six different fractions of BA (0%, 50%, 60%, 75%, 90% & 100%) using a gravelly lateritic soil. The basic properties, shear strength parameters and compressibility characteristics of BA-soil mixtures were investigated. Annual soil loss due to rainfall was measured by conducting artificial rainfall tests for BA-soil mixtures. In addition, chemical composition, pH, electrical conductivity, water holding capacity and micro-structural morphology through Scanning Electron Microscope of BA-soil mixtures were determined to evaluate the potential of soil amendment capabilities. Furthermore, column leaching method was used to evaluate the trace metal concentrations of BA-soil mixtures.

According to results, BA behaves as a poorly graded sand, a free draining material with low compressibility and cohesion. BA has a lower maximum dry density (975 kg/m^3) and higher optimum moisture content (37%). The annual soil loss is “very low” when the fine fraction of the BA-soil mixture is lesser than 20%. BA has the potential to improve agronomic characteristics of soil due to the better water holding capacity and electrical conductivity. BA can adjust soil pH to a desirable plant growth range. Interestingly, the micropore structure of BA has a positive influence on compressibility characteristics, soil erodibility and plant growth while compaction characteristics are influenced negatively. According to column leaching test results, the leachability potential of trace metals in BA does not exceed the allowable limits.

Finally, an empirical relationship for the compaction characteristics was developed using multiple regression analysis with a prediction accuracy less than $\pm 3\%$. Further, the specific gravity of BA was predicted using the chemical composition by soft computing techniques with an accuracy around 96%. The proposed models could be used for the preliminary assessment of the suitability of BA prior to a project.

By considering the results and economic benefits, it can be concluded that, utilizing BA as a partial replacement of a traditional fill material (up to 75%) is the most suitable combination for restoration of abandoned clay mines and similar applications according to the present study.

Key words: Bottom ash, Clay mines, Compaction and compressibility, Rehabilitation, Soil erosion

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This thesis would not have been possible without the guidance and support of several individuals to the successful completion of this research project.

First and foremost, I would like to express my heartfelt gratitude to my research supervisor Dr. (Mrs) A.S. Ranathunga, Department of Civil Engineering, University of Moratuwa, for providing me with this opportunity and her exemplary guidance, valuable feedback, constant encouragement, and support throughout the entire duration of the research project. Without that commitment, encouragement and motivation, my research project would not be a successful one. In addition, I would like to express my sincere appreciation to my co-supervisors, Prof. S.A.S Kulathilaka and Prof. (Ms) W.B. Gunawardana, Department of Civil Engineering, University of Moratuwa for the invaluable support and comments at various stages of my research project. A very special thank goes to Dr. K.V.D.S. Chathuranga, Department of Mechanical Engineering, University of Moratuwa for the valuable assistance specially in MATLAB software.

My sincere appreciation is extended to Prof. (Mrs) J.C.P.H. Gamage, Research Coordinator, Department of Civil Engineering, University of Moratuwa, for her valuable advice and providing necessary information and guidelines. I am grateful to Dr. N.H Priyankara, Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of Ruhuna, and Prof U.P. Nawagamuwa, Department of Civil Engineering, University of Moratuwa for providing valuable feedbacks during the progress evaluations.

Further, I greatly appreciate the immense support and guidance provided by the staffs of Soil Mechanics Laboratory and Environmental Laboratory of University of Moratuwa, Department of Materials Science and Engineering, University of Moratuwa and Industrial Technology Institute (ITI) for the laboratory experimental works within the limited time frame. Also, I would like to thank Norochcholai power plant for providing materials and necessary information.

Last but not least, I would like to thank the Senate Research Committee of University of Moratuwa for funding this research project through long-term grant (SRC/LT/2019/14).

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration	i
Abstract	ii
Acknowledgement.....	iii
Table of contents	iv
List of figures	x
List of tables	xii
List of Notations and Abbreviations	xiv
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Clay Mines	1
1.1.1 Overview	1
1.1.2 Environmental issues in clay mining	2
1.1.3 National policies with the mining	3
1.1.4 Solutions for abandoned clay mines	3
1.2 Coal Power Plants	4
1.2.1 Coal combustion by-products	5
1.2.2 Disposal mechanisms of coal combustion by-products	7
1.2.3 Utilization of BA.....	8
1.2.4 Advantages of using BA in clay mine rehabilitation	10
1.3 Problem Statement and Significance of Research.....	11
1.4 Aims and Objectives	12
1.5 Research Scope.....	13
1.6 Organization of the Thesis	15
1.7 Chapter Summary	18
2 Literature review	19
2.1 Overview	19

2.2	Introduction	19
2.3	Microstructure of BA	20
2.4	Physical Characteristics of BA.....	21
2.4.1	Particle size distribution of BA.....	24
2.4.2	Specific gravity of BA	25
2.4.3	Atterberg limits of BA	26
2.4.4	Permeability of BA	27
2.4.5	Compaction characteristic of BA.....	27
2.4.6	Shear strength of BA.....	29
2.4.7	Compressibility characteristics of BA	30
2.5	Chemical Characteristics of BA	31
2.6	Current Utilization Practices for BA as an Anthropogenic Soil.....	35
2.6.1	BA as a potential fill material	36
2.6.2	Prevention of soil erosion by BA	37
2.6.3	BA as a soil amendment material	38
2.7	Sustainability and Environmental Compatibility of BA as an Anthropogenic Soil.....	39
2.7.1	Trace metal leachability of BA	40
2.8	Conclusions and Suggestions for Future Studies	44
2.9	Chapter Summary.....	44
3	Materials, instrumentation and experimental methods	45
3.1	Overview	45
3.2	Test Specimens used for the Present Research.....	46
3.2.1	Origin of materials	46
3.2.2	Properties of Lakvijaya power plant BA.....	47
3.2.3	Sample preparation.....	47

3.3	Experiments for Potential Backfill Material (Objective 01)	48
3.3.1	Specifications for the testing.....	48
3.3.2	Sample preparation.....	50
3.3.3	Experimental procedure	51
3.4	Experiments for Prevention of Soil Erosion (Objective 02)	52
3.4.1	Instrumentation	52
3.4.2	Sample preparation.....	52
3.4.3	Experimental procedure	53
3.5	Experiments for Prospective Soil Amendment Material (Objective 03).....	55
3.5.1	Selected parameters.....	55
3.5.2	Experimental procedure	55
3.6	Experiments for Potential Damages to the Environment (Objective 04)....	56
3.6.1	Instrumentation	56
3.6.2	Sample preparation.....	57
3.6.3	Experimental procedure	57
3.7	Chapter Summary	58
4	Investigation of the potential of BA as a backfill material - Objective 01	59
4.1	Overview	59
4.2	Basic Engineering Properties	59
4.2.1	Particle size distribution.....	59
4.2.2	Specific gravity	61
4.2.3	Atterberg limits	61
4.2.4	Coefficient of permeability	62
4.2.5	Compaction characteristics	63
4.3	Compressibility Characteristics.....	68
4.4	Shear Strength Parameters.....	72

4.4.1	Slope stability analysis	74
4.5	Elastic modulus	78
4.6	Suitability as a Backfill Material for Mine Rehabilitation	80
4.7	Chapter Summary	81
5	Investigation of the potential of BA to prevent soil erosion - Objective 02	82
5.1	Overview	82
5.2	Annual Soil Loss (ASL)	82
5.3	Chapter Summary	86
6	Investigation of the ability of bA as a prospective soil amendment material - Objective 03	87
6.1	Overview	87
6.2	Chemical Properties	88
6.2.1	pH.....	88
6.2.2	Electrical conductivity	89
6.2.3	Water holding capacity	89
6.2.4	Bulk density	90
6.3	Micro Structural Properties	90
6.4	Mineralogical Composition of BA	93
6.5	Selection of Suitable Crops	94
6.6	Chapter Summary.....	95
7	Investigation of the potential damage to environment with the use of bA - Objective 04	96
7.1	Overview	96
7.2	Column Leaching Test	96
7.3	Implications for field application of BA	100
7.4	Chapter Summary.....	100

8	Development of empirical equations to predict the properties of BA	101
8.1	Overview	101
8.2	Prediction of compaction characteristics of BA.....	101
8.2.1	Introduction and background	101
8.2.2	Available models in literature	102
8.2.3	Methodology	103
8.2.4	Formulation of models	106
8.2.5	MLR analysis	108
8.2.6	Conclusions of MLR analysis	111
8.3	Prediction of Gs of BA using Chemical Composition of BA	111
8.3.1	Introduction and background	111
8.3.2	Methodology	112
8.3.3	Calibration of the model.....	113
8.3.4	Analysis of SVM results	116
8.3.5	Limitations and Recommendations from SVM analysis	118
8.3.6	Conclusions of SVM analysis	118
8.4	Chapter summary	119
9	Conclusions and suggestions for future research.....	120
9.1	Conclusions	120
9.1.1	Conclusions from experimental study.....	120
9.1.2	Conclusions from analytical study.....	123
9.2	Key Findings from the Research	123
9.3	Suggestions for Future Research.....	125
9.3.1	Experimental studies	125
9.3.2	Analytical studies	125
9.4	Publications from the current research	126

References	128
Appendices	156
Appendix A – Compressibility characteristics.....	156
Appendix B – Shear strength parameters.....	162
Appendix C – Annual soil loss of BA – soil mixtures.....	169
Appendix D – Data set used for model development	170

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1: Clay mining in Sri Lanka	1
Figure 1.2: Clay mines filled with water in rainy seasons (Nakagawa et al., 2017)....	2
Figure 1.3: Sources of global power generation in 2019 (Sultana et al., 2021).....	5
Figure 1.4: Schematic diagram of typical coal combustion process	6
Figure 1.5: Schematic diagram of research aims and objectives	13
Figure 2.1: SEM images of BA from different power plants (Circled areas highlight the highly porous microstructure of BA)	20
Figure 2.2: Particle size distribution curve of BA from Tanjung Bin power plant, Malaysia (Marto et al., 2014).....	24
Figure 2.3: Relationship between dry density and moisture content of BA	28
Figure 2.4: Variation in chemical composition of BA in different countries	34
Figure 2.5: Evolution of the utilization of BA as an anthropogenic soil	35
Figure 3.1: Detailed research plan	45
Figure 3.2: Stockpiles of BA at Lakvijaya coal thermal plant, Norochcholai	46
Figure 3.3: (a) BA sample and (b) Soil sample.....	47
Figure 3.4: Experimental apparatuses used for testing BA–soil mixtures.....	49
Figure 3.5: Sample container for artificial rainfall test	52
Figure 3.6: Schematic diagram of artificial rainfall test	54
Figure 3.7: Column leaching test device.....	57
Figure 4.1: Particle size distribution curves of BA-soil samples.....	60
Figure 4.2: Specific gravity of BA-soil samples.....	61
Figure 4.3: Relationship between penetration and moisture content	61
Figure 4.4: Graphical representation of (a) constant head method and (b) falling head method.....	62
Figure 4.5: Ranges of permeability (Terzaghi et al., 1996)	63
Figure 4.6: Standard Proctor compaction curves	64
Figure 4.7: Proctor curves under different saturation period	65
Figure 4.8: Modified Proctor compaction curves	66
Figure 4.9: Comparison of (a) m_v and (b) C_v with the applied stress	70
Figure 4.10: Void ratio vs applied stress relationship.....	72

Figure 4.11: Variation of shear strength parameters.....	73
Figure 4.12: Geometry configuration for the analysis	75
Figure 4.13: Factor of safety of SLOPE/W analysis.....	75
Figure 4.14: Slip surface colour map for 1:2 slope during 100BA.....	76
Figure 4.15: Configuration of geometry for the slope angle of 35°.....	77
Figure 4.16: Factor of safety colour map for 35° slope during 100BA	77
Figure 5.1: ASL of samples with BA content.....	83
Figure 5.2: (a) Ratio of surface water and (b) Ratio of percolation water.....	83
Figure 5.3: Variation of ASL with (a) fine content, (b) coefficient of permeability and (c) water holding capacity.....	84
Figure 6.1: Variation of chemical properties with BA content.....	88
Figure 6.2: Bulk density of BA-soil mixtures at MDD.....	90
Figure 6.3: SEM images of BA and soil samples (2500X).....	91
Figure 6.4: SEM images of BA–soil samples under different magnification levels..	92
Figure 6.5: Suitable crops for BA–soil medium	94
Figure 7.1: Radioactivity concentrations of Sri Lankan soil	99
Figure 8.1: Relationship between MDD and OMC using (a)linear, (b)power, (c)exponential function	105
Figure 8.2: Predicted correlation for MDD and OMC using Eq. 8.9.....	106
Figure 8.3: Variation of MDD with (a) % Sand, (b) % Fine, (c) Cu, (d) Cc and (e) Gs	107
Figure 8.4: Variation of OMC with (a) % Sand, (b) % Fine, (c) Cu, (d) Cc and (e) Gs	107
Figure 8.5: Validation of proposed model for (a) MDD and (b) OMC	109
Figure 8.6: Predictive curves for the estimation of (a) MDD and (b) OMC.....	110
Figure 8.7: Chemical composition of BA used for model development	113
Figure 8.8: Variation of Gs with input variables (a) SiO ₂ , (b) Al ₂ O ₃ , (c) Fe ₂ O ₃ , (d) CaO and (e) LOI.....	114
Figure 8.9: Relationship between Gs and (a) SiO ₂ +Al ₂ O ₃ & Fe ₂ O ₃ , (b) CaO & LOI	115
Figure 8.10: Confusion matrix	117

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1: Generation and utilization of coal combustion by-products in 2016 (Harris et al., 2019).....	6
Table 1.2: Research scope.....	15
Table 2.1: Physical properties of BA from past studies.....	22
Table 2.2: Typical ranges of gradational parameters.....	25
Table 2.3: Categories of specific gravity of BA.....	26
Table 2.4: Variation of shear strength parameters of BA with fine content and chemical compositions.....	29
Table 2.5: A summary of literature on chemical composition of BA in different countries.....	32
Table 2.6 Comparison of BA with agricultural soil.....	39
Table 2.7: A summary of literature on trace metal concentrations of BA in different countries.....	41
Table 3.1: Typical physical properties and mineralogical content of BA from Lakvijaya plant.....	47
Table 3.2: Mix fractions of BA and soil.....	47
Table 3.3: Testing specifications for different tests.....	48
Table 4.1: Soil composition of BA-soil samples.....	59
Table 4.2: Classification of samples.....	60
Table 4.3: Atterberg limits of BA-soil samples.....	62
Table 4.4: Coefficient of permeability values of BA-soil mixtures.....	62
Table 4.5: Standard compaction parameters.....	64
Table 4.6: Comparison of Proctor results for 100BA sample.....	65
Table 4.7: Modified compaction parameters.....	66
Table 4.8: Comparison of MDD and OMC from different literatures.....	67
Table 4.9: Bulk density of BA–soil mixtures at MDD.....	68
Table 4.10: Volume compressibility values with different loadings.....	69
Table 4.11: Coefficient of consolidation values with different loadings.....	69
Table 4.12: Comparison of compressibility characteristics of Asian BA from literature.....	71

Table 4.13: Compressibility characteristics of BA – soil samples	71
Table 4.14: Shear strength parameters	73
Table 4.15: Material properties used in the numerical modelling	74
Table 4.16: Critical factor of safety for 1:2 slope	76
Table 4.17: Critical factor of safety for the slope angle of 35°	78
Table 4.18: Comparison of elastic modulus from literature	79
Table 4.19: Shear modulus and Elastic modulus	79
Table 5.1: Risk assessment of soil erosion in Indonesia	83
Table 5.2: Comparison of results with literature.....	85
Table 6.1: Chemical properties	88
Table 6.2: Average pore size of BA-soil mixtures.....	91
Table 6.3: Mineralogical composition of BA	93
Table 6.4: Comparison of BA and agriculture soil	94
Table 7.1: Trace metal concentration of the samples.....	97
Table 7.2: Trace metal concentration of the samples (Chrishanthi, 2019)	98
Table 7.3: Radioactivity of BA from Norochcholai power plant (Chrishanthi, 2019)	98
Table 8.1: Data set used for model development.....	104
Table 8.2: Data set used for model validation.....	105
Table 8.3: Output of regression analysis for Eqs. 8.11 and 8.12	109
Table 8.4: Models based on chemical composition for fly ash and BA by previous researchers.....	112
Table 8.5: Parameters of the data sets	113
Table 8.6: Different regions of Gs of BA	115
Table 8.7: Combinations of input variables	116
Table 8.8: Performance of models with different kernels functions.....	117
Table 9.1: Summary of optimum results for mine rehabilitation.....	124
Table 9.2: List of Publications from the research	126

LIST OF NOTATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Notations

Notations	Description
As	Arsenic
c	cohesion
Cc	Coefficient of curvature
C _c	Compression index
C _c /(1+e ₀)	Compression ratio
Cd	Cadmium
Cr	Chromium
C _r	Recompression index
C _r /(1+e ₀)	Recompression ratio
Cu	Copper
Cu	Uniformity coefficient
C _v	Coefficient of consolidation
E	Soil erosion per hour
G	Dry density of the sample
G _s	Specific gravity
H	Annual soil erosion
Hg	Mercury
I	Rainfall intensity
k	Coefficient of permeability
m _v	Coefficient of volume compressibility
Ni	Nickel
Pb	Lead
R	Annual rainfall
R	Correlation coefficient
R ²	Coefficient of determination
Se	Selenium
SP	Poorly graded sand
SW	Well graded sand
Zn	Zinc
Φ	Friction angle

Abbreviations

Abbreviations	Description
ASL	Annual soil loss
ASTM	American Standard for Testing and Material
BA	Bottom Ash
CE	Compaction Energy
EC	Electrical conductivity
FC	Fine content
GC	Gravel content
ICP-MS	Inductively coupled plasma – mass spectrometry
LL	Liquid Limit
MDD	Maximum Dry Density
MLR	Multi Linear Regression
OMC	Optimum Moisture Content
PI	Plasticity Index
PL	Plastic Limit
PVC	Polyvinyl chloride
SC	Sand content
SEM	Scanning Electron Microscopy
SVM	Support Vector Machine
USEPA	United States Environmental Protection Agency
USLE	Universal Soil Loss Equation
WHC	Water holding capacity
XRD	X-Ray Diffraction
XRF	X-Ray Fluorescence