

TOPOLOGY OPTIMISATION OF 5000 LB OVER-CENTER BUCKLE

Batuwatta Gamage Chanaka Prabuddha

(118314N)



University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka.
Electronic Theses & Dissertations
Degree of Master of Engineering
www.lib.mrt.ac.lk

Department of Mechanical Engineering

University of Moratuwa
Sri Lanka

August 2015

TOPOLOGY OPTIMISATION OF 5000 LB OVER-CENTER BUCKLE

Batuwatta Gamage Chanaka Prabuddha

118314N



University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka.

Electronic Theses & Dissertations

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

www.lib.mrt.ac.lk

Master of Engineering in Manufacturing Systems Engineering

Department of Mechanical Engineering

University of Moratuwa

Sri Lanka

August 2015

DECLARATION

I declare that this is my own work and this thesis does not incorporate without acknowledgement any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any other university or institute of higher learning and to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person except where the acknowledgement is made in the text.

Also, I hereby grant to University of Moratuwa the non-exclusive right to reproduce and distribute my thesis, in whole or in part in print, electronic or other medium. I retain the right to use this content in whole or part in future works (such as articles or books).

Signature:

Date:



University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka.
Electronic Theses & Dissertations
www.lib.mrt.ac.lk

The above candidate has carried out research for the Master thesis under my supervision. I also acknowledge the contributions made by Lecturer KH Janaka Mangala for the completion of the work.

Name of the supervisor: Senior Lecturer. R. K. P. S. Ranaweera

Signature of the supervisor:

Date:

Abstract

Topology optimisation has for a considerable time been applied successfully in the automotive industry, but still has not commonly become a mainstream technology in the aerospace industry. The aircraft manufactures have already been achieving benefits with optimisation for some areas where as the bottom layer suppliers in the aerospace industry are still following conventional design techniques. Most of metal fittings which are widely used in the aerospace industry with safety nets and straps are identified as bulky and heavy as they are based on conventional designing techniques. 5000 lb over-center buckle (OCB) is one of the most frequently used tightening devices having the aforementioned characteristics.

The purpose of this study is to formulate a mechanism for a strength-based weight reduction on standard 5000 lb OCB which is used in the aerospace industry and consequently, to propose a light-weight design. First objective was to identify the relevant design considerations of existing 5000 lb OCB. Design specifications and standards related to 5000 lb OCB and 5000 lb safety strap were collected and reviewed for collecting necessary strength, functionality and other requirements of 5000 lb OCB. Second objective was to develop a finite element methodology for static structural analysis of 5000 lb OCB. 5000 lb OCB samples were carefully examined to identify the functionality and other necessary requirements of the OCB. OCBs were then subjected to a detail measurement check and the dimensions were used to build a computer aided design (CAD) model for the study. Engineering drawings were also created from the model for future reference. Then OCB samples with polyester webbing parts were subjected to various kind of strength tests using tensile testing machine. Purposes of these tests were to identify the failure loads and failure modes of the OCB itself and the OCB with safety strap in the operational conditions. These experimental results showed that the 5000 lb OCB used in the aerospace industry is an over-design. A second objective was to optimise the 5000 lb OCB using an effective optimisation scheme. Having reviewed on optimisation procedures and current trends in the aerospace industry, Altair HyperMesh software was selected as the numerical simulation tool to setup the finite element model and 'Topology Optimisation' was selected as optimisation method for the study. The finite element model was validated using simulation results and experimental results and the validated methodology was used to setup optimisation problem with aim of reducing weight. In formulating the topology optimisation problem, the minimum averaged compliance of the buckle was taken as the objective, and element density was used as the design variable.

Topology optimisation results were analysed and the elements in the critical regions were derived as geometries to compare those with original OCB model. Considering other functionality requirements with the topology optimisation results, a light-weight design was proposed with step-by-step modifications. Subsequently, FE simulations were repeated for the proposed light-weight design. Comparing the results of the light-weight design with the original model results, the proposed light-weight design can be noted as a better alternative. Nearly 7% (41g) weight reduction could be achieved for 5000 lb OCB using the proposed optimisation procedure.

Keywords:

Finite Element Analysis, Topology optimisation, 5000 lb over-center buckle, Weight reduction

Acknowledgements

The subject of this thesis started with the ideas of thesis advisor Senior Lecturer; RK Pubudu S Ranaweera and Lecturer; KH Janaka Mangala. Their excellent ideas, advises and guidance were invaluable for the completion of this work and I would equally like to express special gratitude for them.

I would equally like to thank Dr. RARC Gopura, the course coordinator of M.Eng / PG Diploma in Manufacturing Systems Engineering, for extending his continues and invaluable support throughout the course. I also like to thank to Dr. N Jayaweera and the non-academic staff of the Metrology laboratory for the services rendered. I would like to thank AmSafe Bridport (Pvt) Ltd, where I started my carrier in the industry, for providing me the opportunity to expertise myself in the aerospace safety equipment manufacturing field. I am also thankful to Mr. Rjiv Butani; Director of Solid Engineering Asia (Pvt) Ltd, for giving me required assistance and encouragement throughout the thesis.

Finally, yet importantly, I am very grateful to my parents, my sister, my brother and importantly to my beloved wife Ransi lamsha for their continued support for reaching my goals.



University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka
Electronic Theses & Dissertations
www.lib.mrt.ac.lk

This thesis is dedicated to my loving parents, Mr. & Mrs. Batuwatta Gamage.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|---|------|
| Declaration of the Candidate and Supervisors..... | i |
| Abstract | ii |
| Acknowledgements | iii |
| Table of Contents | iv |
| List of Figures | vi |
| List of Tables | viii |
| List of Abbreviations | ix |
| 1. CHAPTER 01: GENERAL INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| 1.1. Over-center buckle (OCB) and Application..... | 1 |
| 1.2. Selected 5000 lb OCB Details..... | 4 |
| 2. CHAPTER 02: LITERATURE REVIEW | 6 |
| 2.1. Optimisation and Optimisation Methods | 6 |
| 2.1.1. Optimisation by Evolution..... | 7 |
| 2.1.2. Optimisation by Intuition..... | 7 |
| 2.1.3. Optimisation by Trial and Error Modeling..... | 8 |
| 2.1.4. Optimisation by Numerical Algorithms..... | 8 |
| 2.2. Optimisation in Aerospace Industry..... | 12 |
| 2.2.1. Topology Optimisation in A380 Airbus | 12 |
| 2.2.2. Topology Optimisation in Airbus Helicopters..... | 13 |
| 2.2.3. Topology Optimisation in Honeywell Turbine Engines | 13 |
| 2.3. Topology Optimisation for OCB Optimisation..... | 13 |
| 3. CHAPTER 03: METHODOLOGY | 15 |
| 4. CHAPTER 04: EXPERIMENTS AND RESULTS..... | 20 |
| 4.1. Deformation Check for SWL | 21 |
| 4.2. Tensile Strength Test for Webbing / Buckle Interface..... | 23 |
| 4.3. Tensile Test Results for Buckle Failure | 24 |
| 5. CHAPTER 05: FEM SETUP, ANALYSIS AND RESULTS | 26 |
| 5.1. Finite Element Model (FEM) Setup..... | 26 |
| 5.2. Mesh Quality of the Meshed Model..... | 29 |
| 5.3. Contact Surfaces for the Meshed Model | 32 |

| | | |
|--------|--|----|
| 5.4. | Boundary Conditions of the Meshed Model | 34 |
| 5.5. | Finite Element Model Validation | 35 |
| 5.5.1. | Deformation Check for Model Validation | 35 |
| 5.5.2. | Buckle Failure Mode Analysis for Model Validation..... | 37 |
| 5.6. | Static Structural Tensile Test Results - Original OCB | 38 |
| 5.6.1. | Von-Mises Stress Results (Original Model) - SWL | 38 |
| 5.7. | Topology Optimisation..... | 40 |
| 5.7.1. | Design Space / Non-Design Space..... | 41 |
| 5.7.2. | Responses | 42 |
| 5.7.3. | Optimisation Constraints..... | 42 |
| 5.7.4. | Objective Function | 42 |
| 5.7.5. | Visualization of Results | 43 |
| 5.8. | Proposed Model for 5000 lb OCB..... | 44 |
| 5.9. | Static Structural Tensile Test Results – Optimised OCB | 48 |
| 5.9.1. | Von-Mises Stress Results (Optimised Model) – SWL | 48 |
| 6. | CHAPTER 06: DISCUSSION, CONCLUSIONS AND FUTURE WORK | 50 |
| 6.1. | Discussion..... | 50 |
| 6.2. | Conclusions..... | 52 |
| 6.3. | Future Work | 53 |
| | Reference List | 54 |
| | Appendix A: FEA Packages available for Analysis purposes | 58 |
| | Appendix B: 5000 lb Over-center Buckle Engineering Drawings..... | 59 |
| | Appendix C: Balloon Marked Dimensions for Deformation Check..... | 60 |
| | Appendix D: Time vs Force Graph – Test for OCB Failure..... | 61 |
| | Appendix E: Changes in the Optimised OCB Design | 62 |
| | Appendix F: Estimated Cost Savings for Airlines | 63 |

LIST OF FIGURES

| | |
|--|----|
| Figure 1.1: Different types of over-center buckles | 1 |
| Figure 1.2: Rated Load (RL) and Safe Working Load (SWL) for OCB..... | 2 |
| Figure 1.3: Tie-down straps with different OCBs (Original in color) | 2 |
| Figure 1.4: Tie-down safety strap with OCB | 3 |
| Figure 1.5: Webbing feeding method for OCB..... | 3 |
| Figure 1.6: Applications of tie-down straps (Original in color) | 4 |
| Figure 1.7: 5000 lb OCB – unlock mode | 4 |
| Figure 2.1: Design optimisation cycle | 6 |
| Figure 2.2: Topology optimisation on A380 parts (Original in color)..... | 12 |
| Figure 4.1: Tensile strength test setup – OCB (Original in color)..... | 21 |
| Figure 4.2: Webbing / buckle specimen failure mode (Original in color) | 23 |
| Figure 4.3: Failure mode – Test of buckle till failure | 24 |
| Figure 5.1: Simplified CAD geometry of OCB (Original in color)..... | 27 |
| Figure 5.2: Mappable solid geometry sample | 28 |
| Figure 5.3: Meshed model – OCB (Original in color)..... | 29 |
| Figure 5.4: Hexa and Penta elements – meshed model (Original in color) | 30 |
| Figure 5.5: Mesh elements check (Original in color) | 30 |
| Figure 5.6: Contact surfaces on FEM (Original in color) | 32 |
| Figure 5.7: Contact surfaces between inner body / webbing (Original in color)..... | 33 |
| Figure 5.8: Contact surfaces between webbing / webbing (Original in color) | 33 |
| Figure 5.9: Contact surfaces between webbing / pins (Original in color) | 34 |
| Figure 5.10: Boundary condition for the FE Model (Original in color) | 34 |
| Figure 5.11: Displacement contour to the X direction (Original in color)..... | 35 |
| Figure 5.12: Critical load bearing pins (Original in color) | 36 |
| Figure 5.13: Deformation (8x) of the load bearing pins (Original in color) | 36 |
| Figure 5.14: OCB failure - experimental vs theoretical (Original in color)..... | 38 |
| Figure 5.15: Von-mises contour for SWL - Original OCB (Original in color) | 39 |
| Figure 5.16: Design and non-design spaces in OCB model (Original in color) | 41 |
| Figure 5.17: Compliance Vs Iteration number graph..... | 43 |
| Figure 5.18: Load density value variation (Original in color) | 44 |

Figure 5.19: Recovered optimised geometry (Original in color)..... 45
Figure 5.20: Optimised geometry vs original geometry (Original in color) 45
Figure 5.21: Proposed model for the 5000 lb OCB 48
Figure 5.22: Von-mises contour for SWL - Optimised OCB (Original in color) 49



University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka.
Electronic Theses & Dissertations
www.lib.mrt.ac.lk

LIST OF TABLES

| | |
|---|----|
| Table 1.1: 5000 lb OCB requirements | 5 |
| Table 4.1: Deformation results for SWL of original OCB..... | 22 |
| Table 4.2: Webbing / buckle interface tensile test experimental data..... | 23 |
| Table 4.3: Buckle failure tensile test experimental data | 24 |
| Table 5.1: Properties of the material used..... | 27 |
| Table 5.2: Mesh quality check values | 31 |
| Table 5.3: Contact surfaces for sliding contacts | 33 |
| Table 5.4: Deformation check (experimental vs theoretical) - model validation | 37 |
| Table 5.5: New proposed geometry vs the original model | 46 |



University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka.
Electronic Theses & Dissertations
www.lib.mrt.ac.lk

List of Abbreviations

| Abbreviation | Description |
|--------------|---------------------------------|
| OCB | Over-center Buckle |
| CAD | Computer Aided Design |
| CAE | Computer Aided Engineering |
| FE | Finite Element |
| FEA | Finite Element Analysis |
| FEM | Finite Element Model |
| RL | Rated Load |
| SWL | Safe Working Load |
| IB | Inner Body |
| OB | Outer Body |
| SAE | Society of Automotive Engineers |



University of Moratuwa, Sri Lanka.
Electronic Theses & Dissertations
www.lib.mrt.ac.lk